Examining access to health services for women of reproductive age from ethnic communities in Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) of Bangladesh

Shahinoor Akter

MPH (Australia); MSS (Anthro); BSS (Anthro) Hons (Bangladesh) Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Public Health & Behavioural Science)



School of Medicine and Public Health Faculty of Health and Medicine University of Newcastle

DEDICATION

То

AMMA & ABBA

WHO TAUGHT ME TO DREAM BY SACRIFICING THEIR DREAMS

DECLARATIONS

Statement of Originality

I hereby certify that the work embodied in the thesis is my own work, conducted under normal supervision. The thesis contains no material which has been accepted, or is being examined, for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968 and any approved embargo.

Collaboration

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis has been done in collaboration with other researchers. I have included as part of the thesis a statement clearly outlining the extent of collaboration, with whom and under what auspices.

Authorship

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis contains published papers of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of this thesis a written statement, endorsed by my supervisors, attesting to my contribution to the joint publications.

Signed: (Shahinoor Akter)

Date: 31 May 2020

List of Publications Included As Part of Thesis

In order of appearance in thesis:

- Akter S, Davies K, Rich J & Inder K. Indigenous women's access to maternal healthcare services in lower- and middle-income countries: a systematic integrative review. International Journal of Public Health 2018; 1-11; doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00038-018-1177-4</u>
- Akter S, Rich J, Davies K & Inder K. Access to maternal health care services among Indigenous women in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh: A cross-sectional study. BMJ Open 2019; 1-11; doi: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2019-033224</u>

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP

I (Shahinoor Akter) here by certify that the work embodied in this thesis contains published paper/s/scholarly work of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the thesis a written declaration endorsed in writing by my supervisor, attesting to my contribution to the joint publication/s/scholarly work.

Candidate's signature:

Date: 31 May 2020

I (Associate Professor Kerry J Inder) attest that Research Higher Degree candidate **Shahinoor Akter** has contributed substantially to the following publications for which I am a co-author. For this publication, Shahinoor was responsible for conceiving the topic of the systematic review, running the search strategy, extracting data, conducting analysis, interpreting findings and writing and preparing the manuscript for publication.

- Paper 1: Akter S, Davies K, Rich J & Inder K. Indigenous women's access to maternal healthcare services in lower- and middle-income countries: a systematic integrative review. International Journal of Public Health 2018; 1-11; doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00038-018-1177-4</u>
- Paper 2: Akter S, Rich J, Davies K & Inder K. Access to maternal health care services among Indigenous women in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh: A cross-sectional study. *BMJ Open* 2019; 1-11; doi: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2019-033224</u>

Supervisor's signature:

Date: 31/05/2020

Conference Presentations

- Akter, S, Davies, K, Rich, J. & Inder, K. (2019). Review of Indigenous women's access to maternal healthcare in low-middle income countries. Presented at Australian Public Health Conference 2019 in Adelaide, South Australia between 17 and 19 September 2019.
- Akter, S, Davies, K, Rich, J. & Inder, K. (2019). Maternal health care access among Indigenous women in Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh. Presented at Australian Public Health Conference 2019 in Adelaide, South Australia between 17 and 19 September 2019.
- Akter, S, Davies, K, Rich, J. & Inder, K. (2019). Attitudes towards & experiences of accessing maternal health care services among the Indigenous women in Khagrachhari district, Bangladesh. The abstract presented in International Conference on Public Health conference in Malaysia between 10 and 12 July. Received "Session's Best Presentation" award for this presentation.
- Akter, S, Davies, K, Rich, J. & Inder, K. (2018). Antenatal care (ANC) service utilisation among Indigenous women in Chittagong Hill Tracts Bangladesh. Presented in Australian Public Health Conference, Cairns, Queensland on between 26 and 28 September 2018.

Acknowledgements

While it has always been a dream to pursue an overseas doctoral degree at a renowned university, the scholarship offer from The University of Newcastle, Australia was a dream come true for me. Therefore, I gratefully acknowledge The University of Newcastle, Australia, for providing me with the opportunity to study my PhD through the UNIPRS and UNRSC 50:50 scholarship.

This PhD thesis is the culmination of years of work conducted in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh, with many individuals providing support, insight, and inspiration in their unique ways. I owe them all a lot.

My sincere appreciation and thanks to my primary supervisor, Associate Professor Kerry J Inder, for her constant support, encouragement, and eternal patience with the pace of my work. Your compact guidance and direction helped me overcoming all challenges I faced during my PhD journey. Thank you for always listening to my ideas (even if it did not make any practical sense); leading them in when required; troubleshooting a truly astounding number of exceptional circumstances and being a motivating and enthusiastic teacher and advisor. I cannot thank you enough for being so generous and for always being available to answer my questions no matter when. I am incredibly fortunate to have you as my primary supervisor.

I would like to express my gratitude to my co-supervisors, Dr Kate Davies and Dr Jane L Rich, for their dedicated support, professional guidance, and thoughtful feedback throughout my PhD, and finally, for their endless enthusiasm for my study topic. You have extended all possible resources to create an environment that helped me develop my academic and research skills as well as remain consistent and confident in the progress I was making in my studies. Thank you both for being such incredible mentors throughout my PhD project. Finally, I must say, a supervision team comprising of Dr Kerry, Dr Kate and Dr Jane is incomparable. I cannot conceive of any better supervision team, and I am incredibly blessed to have you three as my supervisors.

I would like to thank the Hunter Medical Research Institute, Australia and Jagannath University, Bangladesh for all the support and assistance extended for my project. Many thanks to the Research Centre for Generational Health and Ageing group for its generous support.

I am indebted to the Indigenous women who participated and shared their valuable information in this study. This study would not have been possible without the Indigenous women who devoted their precious time as participants. My heartiest gratitude to Indigenous leaders, Indigenous health workers and local people in the research area for their meaningful engagement with this research project. I overcame all challenges of conducting research in the remotest hilly areas because of the continuous support from the local communities. Special thanks to Zahid uncle, Shekhor Da, Kanchanbala Tripura, Dhirotibala Tripura, Krittibala Tripura, Kobita Tripura, Ratnashova Chakma., Kakoli Chakma, Hasi Chakma, Lucky Chakma, Nanika Chakma and Lolita Tripura. Without their support, my fieldwork would not have completed safely and in a timely manner.

For the past four years, I have had the privilege of working with a bunch of motivated and diligent PhD fellows with who my journey became full of fun rather than tedious. I would like to thank few dearest friends of mine for stepping in whenever I needed their help: Abir, Aida, Edwina, Jo, Liana, Melissa, Mijan Bhai, Nanda, Nuruzzaman, Parivash, Sari, Shazia, Tanmay, Tesfa, and Vrushali. You guys have supported and enriched my PhD work, by sharing ideas, and thoughts regarding different aspects of research, challenging my positions, having and intellectual debates and many laughs over countless cups of coffee. I would also like to thank the following people for their invaluable advice whenever I reached out for help: Dr Shanzida Farhana, Dr Khadija Mitu, Dr Sadaf Noor Islam, Dr Ala Uddin, Dr Tazeen Majeed, Jesmin Khan Muna, Sadia Chowdhury, Dianne Riordan, and Stephen Hancock.

I am grateful to five best friends of my life who are my partner in crime and who loved me unconditionally even though I do not deserve that much: Tabassum, Smriti, Kausar, Humaira and Nigar. Thank you for always being there for me whenever I needed to vent myself. I am also thankful to Mobashara Apa, a person who extended her hands without questioning anything.

To my family: My Mom and Dad. I know my Dad is no more with us, but I believe he is with me. He fought in the Independence war of Bangladesh and fought for equity for people throughout his life. Being a 'not so well-educated person', he realised the value of education. He always encouraged his children to be educated and did his best to fulfil all the needs we had for our training. My mom, a real-life fighter who has survived many dreadful situations in her life, is my role model. Their blessings have enabled me to come this far.

Thank you to my one and only sister for being a role model full of energy. You have taught me to keep smiling, even on the roughest day of my life. Thank you for your ongoing support and encouragement that I be an example to the young women in our small town and beyond undertaking higher studies. I would like to offer my gratitude to my brothers for their support and committed care. And last, but certainly not least, to my nephews and nieces. You are the ones who make my life enjoyable and fulfilling. Especially, Rafan, who check on me every day. Every time I see your face over WhatsApp call, I forget about all the stresses of PhD life and feel enthused.

TABLE OF CONTENT

Abs	stract	Х	xii
1 E	BACKO	GROUND OF THE STUDY	1
1.1	The	esis overview	4
1.2	Disc	closure of the Researcher	6
1.3	Goa	lls for this research	6
L	OWE	ENOUS WOMEN'S ACCESS TO MATERNAL HEALTHCARE SERVIO R-AND MIDDLE-INCOME COUNTRIES: A SYSTEMATIC INTEGRA W	ATIVE
0ve	erviev	N	8
Abs	stract		9
2.1	Intr	oduction	10
2.2	Met	thods	11
	2.2.1	Eligibility criteria	11
	2.2.2	Databases and search	13
	2.2.3	Data extraction and evaluation	13
	2.2.4	Data analysis and synthesis of results	13
2.3	Res	ults	14
	2.3.1	Search results	14
	2.3.2	Study characteristics	14
2.4	Finc	dings from quantitative studies	15
	2.4.1	Influential factors that affect Indigenous women's MH services access	.18
2.5	Fine	dings from qualitative studies	19
	2.5.1	Barriers before accessing services	19
	2.5.2	Barriers within the services	19
	2.5.3	Cultural preferences for care during and after pregnancy	19
	2.5.4	Cultural preferences during delivery	20
	2.5.5	Service user's perspective on facilities	20
		2.5.5.1 Culturally insensitive and invasive nature of care services	_20
		2.5.5.2 Lack of available resources	_21
		2.5.5.3 Lack of community participation	_21
		2.5.5.4 Policy recommendations to improve Indigenous health services	_22

2.6	Inte	gration of findings from included studies	22
2.7	Disc	cussion	24
2.8	Stre	ngths and Limitations	25
2.9		clusion	
3 R	ESEA	RCH DESIGN AND METHODS	27
		rview of mixed method approach	
	3.1.1	Mixed method study design and its development	
	3.1.2	Reasons for using mixed methods approach	
	3.1.3	Challenges of using mixed method study design	
	3.1.4	Research design: A mixed method sequential study	
3.2		earch aims and questions	
3.3		ly setting	
	3.3.1	Matiranga Upazila	
	3.3.2	Khagrachhari Sadar upazila	
	5.5.2	3.3.2.1 Health care facilities in Khagrachhari district	
		3.3.2.2 Past and present doorstep health care services in the CHT	
3.4	Ethi	cal considerations	
5.1	Lun	3.4.1.1 Informed consent process	
		3.4.1.2 Voluntary participation and withdrawal from the study	
		3.4.1.3 Confidentiality	
		3.4.1.4 Researcher safety	
3.5	Data	a collection tools	45
	3.5.1	Survey questionnaire	45
	3.5.2	In-depth interviews	
	3.5.3	Key informant interviews	
3.6	Sam	pling, sample population and recruitment procedures	
	3.6.1	Eligibility Criteria	
3.7		a Collection Process	
_	3.7.1	Method 1: Quantitative survey	
	J./.I	3.7.1.1 Field staff selection for the survey	
		3.7.1.1 Field stall selection for the survey 3.7.1.2 Study initiation meeting	
		3.7.1.2 Survey data collection	

	3.7.1.4 Sample size calculation for survey	53
3.7.2	Method 2: Qualitative interviews	56
	3.7.2.1 In-depth interviews with MHC service users and non-users services	
	3.7.2.2 Key informant interviews	57
	3.7.2.3 Qualitative interview procedures	59
3.8 Da	ta Management and Monitoring	59
3.9 Da	ta Analysis	61
3.9.1	Quantitative data analysis	61
3.9.2	Qualitative data analysis	66
3.9.3	Integration of the quantitative and qualitative analysis	67
3.9.4	Reflexivity in mixed method research	68
	3.9.4.1 Positioning myself: introspective reflexivity	68
3.10 Co	1clusion	75
STUD	IE CHITTAGONG HILL TRACTS, BANGLADESH: A CROSS Y	76
STUD Overvie	Y	76
STUD Overvie Abstract	Y w	76 76 77
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int	Y w t roduction	76 76 77 79
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y w roduction thod	76 76 77 79 80
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int	Y	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y w w roduction thod Study design and setting	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me	Y w roduction thod Study design and setting	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me 4.2.1	Y w roduction thod Study design and setting	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me 4.2.1 4.2.1	Y w roduction thod Study design and setting	
STUD Overvie Abstract 4.1 Int 4.2 Me 4.2.1 4.2.1	Y w roduction thod Study design and setting	

A	CCESS	ENCE AND FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH ANTENATAL CA AMONG INDIGENOUS WOMEN IN THE CHITTAGONG HIL ADESH: A CROSS-SECTIONAL STUDY	L TRACTS,
0v	erview	7	97
Ab	stract.		98
5.1	Intro	oduction	99
5.2	Met	hod	101
	5.2.1	Study design	
	5.2.2	Study setting	
	5.2.3	Participants	
	5.2.4	Variables	
	5.2.5	Data source and measures	
	5.2.6	Study size	
	5.2.7	Outcome variables	
	5.2.8	Statistical methods	
	5.2.9	Ethical considerations	
5.3	Resu	ults	104
	5.3.1	Sociodemographic characteristics of the sample	
	5.3.2	Knowledge and prevalence of access to available ANC services fa	
	5.3.3	ANC service charactersitics	
	5.3.4	Factors associated with knowing about ANC services	
	5.3.5	Factors associated with attending ANC services during pregnand	cy 110
5.4	Disc	ussion	114
	5.4.1	Strengths and limitations	
5.5	Con	clusion	118
_	TO DEI INDIG	ENCE AND FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH KNOWLEDGE A LIVERY SERVICES AT PRIMARY HEALTH CARE FACILITIE ENOUS WOMEN IN KHAGRACHHARI DISTRICT BANGLA SECTIONAL STUDY	ES AMONG DESH – A
0v	erview	7	119
Ab	stract.		120
		oduction	

6.2	Met	hods	124
	6.2.1	Study design	124
	6.2.2	Setting	124
	6.2.3	Participants	124
	6.2.4	Study size	125
	6.2.5	Data sources measurements	125
	6.2.6	Outcome variables	125
	6.2.7	Statistical methods	
6.3	Res	ults	127
	6.3.1	Factors associated with having knowledge about facility delivery	
	6.3.2	Factors associated with place of last delivery among Indigenous v	
6.4	Disc	ussion	137
	6.4.1	Limitations	140
6.5	Con	clusion	141
A I	CCESS BANGL	ENCE AND FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH POSTNATAL CAR AMONG INDIGENOUS WOMEN IN THE CHITTAGONG HILI ADESH: A CROSS-SECTIONAL STUDY	L TRACTS, 142
7.1		oduction	
7.2	Mat	erials and method	146
	7.2.1	Study design and study sites	146
	7.2.2	Study participants	146
	7.2.3	Data collection	146
	7.2.4	Sample size	147
	7.2.5	Outcome variables	147
	7.2.6	Statistical methods	147
7.3	Ethi	cal considerations	148
7.4	Res	ults	149
	7.4.1	Overall characteristics of the participants	149
	7.4.2	Prevalence of accessing PNC services at the primary care level	149

	7.4.3	Factors associated with knowing PNC services at the primary care l	
	7.4.4	Factors associated with attending PNC services during pregnancy	154
7.5	Disc	ussion	157
		Strengths and limitations	
7.6		clusion	
SEF	RVICES	RIERS AND ENABLERS TO ACCESSING MATERNAL HEALTH IN THE CHITTAGONG HILL TRACTS, BANGLADESH: A QUA IPTIVE STUDY OF INDIGENOUS WOMEN'S EXPERIENCES	LITATIVE
Ove	erview	,	162
Abs	stract .		163
8.1	Intro	oduction	164
8.2	Meth	nods	166
	8.2.1	Study design	166
	8.2.2	Study setting	166
	8.2.3	Recruitment	166
	8.2.4	Data collection	167
	8.2.5	Data analysis	168
	8.2.6	Ethics	168
8.3	Resu	ılts	168
	8.3.1	Demographic characteristics of participants	168
		8.3.1.1 User group	168
		8.3.1.2 Non-user group	172
	8.3.2	MHC services are for dealing with complications: "Why would I go, not have any complications?"	
	8.3.3	Barriers that prevented women from accessing MHC services	174
		8.3.3.1 Lack of knowledge about the services and facilities	175
		8.3.3.2 Lack of knowledge on the importance of attending ANC and PNC s 176	ervices
		8.3.3.3 Distance and lack of available transport	176
		8.3.3.4 Fears related to medical intervention	177
	8.3.4	Deterrents to future MHC service access	179
		8.3.4.1 Lack of trust in the quality of care at public facilities	179
		8.3.4.2 'Unofficial' costs – even in so-called 'free' facilities	179

	8.3.4.3 Maltreatment from hospital staff	181
	8.3.4.4 Lack of appropriate and accessible information	182
8.3.5	Maternal health care values	
	8.3.5.1 The importance of home	183
	8.3.5.2 Flexible payment options: "We can pay them (TBAs) later"	184
	8.3.5.3 Personal connections	185
8.4 Dis	cussion	185
8.4.1	Strengths and limitations	
8.5 Coi	1clusion	189
	ENOUS WOMEN'S SATISFACTION WITH MATERNAL HEAD CES IN CHITTAGONG HILL TRACTS, BANGLADESH	_
Overvie	w	190
Abstract		191
9.1 Int	roduction	192
9.2 Me	thods	193
9.2.1	Study design and study sites	
9.2.2	Study participants	
9.2.3	Data collection	
9.2.4	Data analyses	
	9.2.4.1 Quantitative	194
	9.2.4.2 Qualitative	195
9.2.5	Ethics	
9.3 Res	sults	195
9.3.1	Accessing maternal health care services	
	9.3.1.1 Socio-demographic characteristics	
	9.3.1.2 Satisfaction with MHC services – survey results	199
	9.3.1.3 Satisfaction with maternal health care services – interview fin	dings 202
9.4 Dis	cussion	206
9.4.1	Strengths and limitations	208
	nclusions	

Overview	210
Abstract	211
10.1 Introduction	212
10.2 Method	213
10.2.1 Study design and setting	
10.2.2 Study participants	214
10.2.3 Recruitment and Data collection	
10.2.4 Data analysis	
10.2.5 Ethical consideration	
10.3 Results	215
10.3.1 Resources and infrastructure: "That's not enough to do my	y job" 216
10.3.2 Community engagement: "this is not just about 'women's	
10.3.3 Cultural beliefs around pregnancy and childbirth	
10.3.4 Perception about pregnancy and childbirth: it is a "natura"	l event" 219
10.3.5 Distance and costs: "It is not easy for us"	
10.3.6 Indigenous representation within facilitie	
10.3.7 Knowledge about MHC services	
10.3.8 Fear and shyness related to facility delivery services	
10.3.9 Care providers' behaviour	
10.4 Discussion	225
10.4.1 Strengths and limitations	
10.5 Conclusion	229
11 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION	
11.1 Rationale and significance of the current study	231
11.2 Summary and discussion of key findings: Inequalities i 233	
11.2.1 Systematic literature review on Indigenous women's heal and middle-income countries	
11.2.2 CHT Indigenous women's status of accessing MHC service	s234
11.2.3 Prevalence of knowledge about ANC, facility delivery and	

11.2.4	Independent factors associated with knowledge about ANC, facility delivery and PNC services
11.2.5	Prevalence of accessing ANC, facility delivery and PNC services
11.2.6	Independent factors associated with accessing ANC, facility delivery and PNC services
11.2.7	Differences among Indigenous groups regarding accessing MHC services
11.2.8	Barriers in accessing MHC services and unmet needs to be addressed243
11.2.9	Satisfaction with existing MHC services245
11.2.1(Lessons learned as a researcher undertaking research in Indigenous communities
11.3 Strei	ngths and limitations248
11.4 Impl	ication for policy251
11.4.1	Integrate culture and Indigenous women's health issues into current policy
11.4.2	Improve visibility of Indigenous women's health status in national reports
11.4.3	Create a culturally-friendly health system for Indigenous women252
11.4.4	Reach out to the remotest areas
11.5 Impl	ication for practice254
11.6 Impl	ications for future research255
11.7 Conc	lusion257
Reference	es258
Appendix	A: Published paper 1 (Chapter 2)282
Appendix Bang	B: Survey questionnaire for the research project (English & gla)
Appendix	C: Participant Statement for survey (in English & Bangla)322
	D: Consent for study participants of the research project (in ish & Bangla)341
	E: Interview protocol for the respondents who participated in ace-to-face interview (in English & Bangla)348
	F: Interview protocol for Key informant interviews (in English & gla)
	G: Letter of approval from Human Research Ethics Committee at University of Newcastle

Appendix H: Letter of approval from Jagannath University, Dhaka,	
Bangladesh	.361
Appendix I: Published Paper 2 (Chapter 4)	.362
Appendix J: License of agreement for published paper 1	.373
Appendix K: Supplementary tables	.374

Index of Tables

Table 1: Summary of key characteristics of the included studies in the systematic integrative review of
Indigenous women's access to maternal health care services in Lower and Middle-
income countries16
Table 2: Key issues discussed in the included qualitative articles in this review
Table 3: Key maternal health care services antenatal care (ANC), delivery and post-natal care (PNC) 23
Table 4: Health care services provided by public facilities in Bangladesh: (Source: Health System in
Transition: Bangladesh health system review ^[103]
Table 5: Available health care facilities in Khagrachhari hill district (Source: District Statistics 2011:
Khagachhari ^[100]
Table 6: Quantitative survey outcome 46
Table 7: Qualitative tools for addressing study objectives
Table 8: Estimated number of females in each Indigenous group
Table 9: Number of In-depth Interviews and Key Informant Interviews 59
Table 10 : Independent variables included in the logistic regression analyses for each outcome 63
Table 11: Socio-demographic characteristics of Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts,
Bangladesh who accessed at least one MHC service for last delivery
Table 12: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression models for identifying factors associated
with access to MHC services among Indigenous women in Chittagong Hill Tracts,
Bangladesh, after adjusting for clustering by para91
Table 13: Socio-demographic characteristics associated with Antenatal Care (ANC) knowledge for
Indigenous women cohort who participated in the survey; n=438 108
Table 14: Univariate and final multivariable logistic regression model for identifying factors
associated with having antenatal care (ANC) knowledge among Indigenous women in
Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh, after adjusting for clustering by para; n=438 110
Table 15: Socio-demographic characteristics associated with antenatal care (ANC) attendance for 304
Indigenous women cohort who reported having knowledge on ANC services during their
last pregnancy
Table 16: Univariate and final multivariate logistic regression model for identifying factors associatedwith attending antenatal care (ANC) services among Indigenous women in ChittagongHill Tracts, Bangladesh, after adjusting for clustering by para; n=304
Table 17: Socio-demographic and obstetric characteristics of Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill
Tracts, Bangladesh who had prior knowledge on facility delivery during their last
pregnancy
Table 18: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression models for identifying factors associated
with prior knowledge about facility delivery services among Indigenous women in
Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh; n=438
Table 19: Socio-demographic and obstetric characteristics of Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill
Tracts, Bangladesh who knew about facility delivery services and attended during their
last childbirth compared to those who did not attend; n=320
-

Table 20: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression models for identifying factors influencing
attending facility delivery services among Indigenous women in Chittagong Hill Tracts,
Bangladesh who knew about delivery services; n=320 136
Table 21: Socio-demographic characteristics of Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts,
Bangladesh who did and did not have knowledge of post-natal care (PNC) services for
their last delivery, n=438 152
Table 22: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression analyses for having prior knowledge about
post-natal care services among Indigenous women in Chittagong Hill Tracts, n=438 154
Table 23: Socio-demographic characteristics associated with post-natal care (PNC) attendance for
Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts Bangladesh, n=438 155
Table 24: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression analyses for post-natal care (PNC) services
attendance among Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh, n=438
Table 25: Socio-demographic status and reported information on maternal health care service
utilisation during last pregnancy and delivery by the User group and list of services
accessed by these group 170
Table 26: Socio-demographic status and reported information on maternal health care services
utilisation during last pregnancy and delivery by the Non-user group of this study 173
Table 27: Facilities where Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh accessed
maternal healthcare services
Table 28: Socio-demographic characteristics of Indigenous women from two subdistricts of
Khagrachhari, Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh who accessed at least one maternal
health care service for last delivery, (n=258) 197
Table 29: Distribution of Indigenous women's responses regarding various aspects of satisfaction on
antenatal care services access at existing facility services, n=258 199
Table 30: Distribution of Indigenous women's responses regarding various aspects of satisfaction on
facility delivery access, n=143 200
Table 31: Distribution of Indigenous women's responses regarding various aspects of satisfaction on
postnatal care service access, n=43
Table 32: Univariate and multivariable logistic regression analysis for overall satisfaction with
antenatal care (ANC) services by the Chittagong Hill Tracts Indigenous women, after
adjusting for clustering by district; n=232 202
Table 33: Socio-demographic characteristics of eight key informants from Chittagong Hill Tracts,
Bangladesh
Table 34: List of independent factors associated with having knowledge about antenatal, facility
delivery and postnatal care services
Table 35: Prevalence of knowledge and access to MHC, ANC, facility delivery and PNC services by
ethnicity, n=438
Table 36: List of independent factors associated with accessing maternal health care services
including antenatal, facility delivery and postnatal care services separately

Index of Figures

Figure 1: Article search and selection process using PRISMA flowchart ^[56]	12
Figure 2: Explanatory sequential mixed method design used in this study	34
Figure 3: Map of Bangladesh and Khagrachhari district where the study was conducted (Created	l using
ArcMap 10.6.1 software)	
Figure 4: Administrative units of the CHT ^[100]	37
Figure 5: Bangladesh Health System Review 2014. This Figure has been adopted from: "Health	-
System in Transition: Bangladesh health system review" report [103]	40
Figure 6: Schematic representation of Study Procedures	51
Figure 7: Study outline	52
Figure 8: Different steps or phases of thematic analysis (adapted from Braun and Clarke (2006))) 67
Figure 9: Map of Bangladesh and Khagrachhari district where the study was conducted (Created	l using
ArcMap 10.6.1 software)	81
Figure 10: Flow-chart defining the cohort of Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts,	
Bangladesh	86
Figure 11: Estimated prevalence of accessing MHC services during pregnancy and delivery by t	he
Indigenous women from Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh	87
Figure 12: Distribution of Indigenous women by facility attended, n=438	106
Figure 13: Reasons for attending 1st ANC check during last pregnancy	106
Figure 14: (A) Distribution of place of last childbirth among Indigenous women from three ethn	ic
groups who participated in the survey and (B) Persons involved in the decision-ma	king
for the participant's place of childbirth	128
Figure 15: Reasons for home delivery during last childbirth among Indigenous women in the CH	HT.
(TBA = Traditional Birth Attendant; CSBA = Community Skilled Birth Attendant)	128
Figure 16: Prevalence of facilities accessed by Indigenous women for their last delivery	129
Figure 17 A & B: Source of information for Indigenous women's knowledge of postnatal care	
services and benefits of attending postnatal care services	149
Figure 18: Facilities where CHT Indigenous women accessed postnatal care services following	their
last delivery	
Figure 19: Discussion in relation to the overall findings of the thesis	231

List of abbreviations

AOR	Adjusted Odds Ratios
ANC	Antenatal Care
BBS	Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics
BDT	Bangladeshi Taka
CC	Community Clinics
CSBA	Community Skilled Birth Attendant
CHT	Chittagong Hill Tracts
CHTDF	Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facility
CI	Confidence Intervals
EmOC	Emergency Obstetrical Care
EPI	Expanded Programme on Immunization
GFATM	Global Fund to fight AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria
GPS	Global Positioning System
HDRC	Human Development Research Centre
ICDDR,B	International Centre for Diarrheal Disease Research, Bangladesh
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MHC	Maternal Health Care
MoHFW	Ministry of Health and Family Welfare [Bangladesh]
MMR	Maternal Mortality Ratio
MCWC	Mother and Child Welfare Centre
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
OR	Odds Ratios
PNC	Post-Natal care
PRISMA	Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
TBAs	Traditional Birth Attendants
UHC	Upazila Health Complex
UHFWC	Union Health and Family Welfare Centres
USC	Union Sub-Centres
UON	University of Newcastle
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNDP-CHTDF	United Nations Development Program- Chittagong Hill Tracts
	Development Facility
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WB	World Bank
WHO	World Health Organisation

ABSTRACT

Background

During the Millennium Development Goal era, Bangladesh significantly improved maternal health outcomes. However, maternal health data on Indigenous women in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) is not available and limited evidence suggests that maternal health outcomes for these women have not improved in line with their non-Indigenous peers. This thesis investigates maternal health care (MHC) service access, satisfaction, and experiences among Indigenous women in the CHT, Bangladesh.

Methods

To undertake this investigation a sequential mixed-methods design, comprising a population-based cross-sectional survey and qualitative interviews, was informed by an integrative literature review of MHC service utilisation among Indigenous women in lower and middle-income countries. Indigenous women aged 15 to 49 years from Chakma, Marma and Tripura communities, within three years of delivery, were invited to participate in the study. Knowledge about, and prevalence of access to, Ante-Natal Care (ANC), facility delivery and Post-Natal Care (PNC) services were estimated. Factors associated with knowledge, access and satisfaction with care were determined using multivariable logistic regression, adjusted for clustering by village. In-depth interviews with 21 Indigenous women, using qualitative description techniques and with eight key informants (Indigenous community leaders and health care providers) using an ethnographic approach were conducted to explore experiences accessing MHC services. Qualitative data were analysed thematically. Findings from these mixed methods were integrated to formulate policy and practice recommendations and future research.

Results

From a total of 494 Indigenous women across two sub-districts, 438 participated in the survey (mean age 25 years, 89% response rate). Survey data revealed the estimated prevalence of *knowing about* ANC, facility delivery and PNC were 69%, 73%, and 16.4% respectively. Independent factors associated with knowing about ANC services, in order of effect size, were higher education, knowledge about nearest facilities, higher household income and older age. Independent factors associated with knowing about facility delivery were knowledge about nearest facilities; higher household income and attending ANC. Women involved in income generating activities had significantly reduced odds of

knowing about delivery services. Factors independently associated with knowing about PNC services were delivery at a facility, knowledge of childbirth complications, access to media and Marma ethnicity.

Prevalence of *access* to any MHC, ANC, delivery and PNC service were estimated at 59%, 53%, 33% and 9.8% respectively. Independent factors associated with accessing any MHC service in order of effect size, were knowledge of nearest facilities, knowledge of pregnancy-related complications, education and number of pregnancies. Independent factors associated with accessing ANC services, were knowledge about ANC benefits, place of residence and higher household income. Independent factors associated with accessing facility delivery were attending ANC, access to media, partner's level of education and place of residence. Factors independently associated with accessing PNC services were knowledge of PNC benefits and older age.

Descriptive analyses of survey data revealed that CHT Indigenous women were satisfied overall with interpersonal relationships with healthcare providers and with communication in their native language. Maintenance of personal privacy was the key independent factor associated with satisfaction of ANC services. Qualitative findings revealed that Indigenous women were not satisfied with MHC services because personal privacy at childbirth was not maintained and because of limited access to health professionals and essential resources at facilities.

Interview data revealed that CHT Indigenous women lacked knowledge about freely available, lowcost services within their communities and they mostly accessed MHC services for pregnancy-related complications that were unmanageable at home. Abusive and unprofessional behaviour from staff at public facilities, including Indigenous staff, discouraged women from accessing services. Key informants reported that distance and inadequate resources constrained healthcare providers' opportunities to provide services. They also reported there was little engagement with communities to inform the design of health programs, thus creating culturally unfriendly environments.

Discussion

Access to MHC services was lower among Indigenous women from CHT communities than the national average. CHT Indigenous women experienced discrimination by health staff including Indigenous health staff at public facilities. Absence of community-engagement in the health programs gave limited opportunities for Indigenous women to have their voices heard. Not using Indigenous native language

may have limited participation and the cross-sectional design did not allow temporal sequence to be determined and is subject to recall bias and social desirability bias. The small sample of qualitative interviews limits transferability of results and may have been subject to participation bias.

Conclusion

Lower access to maternal healthcare services among Indigenous CHT women is associated with a lack of knowledge about services and culturally unfriendly environments. Knowledge about nearest health facilities, pregnancy and childbirth complications and providing culturally appropriate health systems may improve MHC access for Indigenous women. Community engagement and context specific interventions are needed to improve maternal health outcomes for Indigenous women and their children.